# 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum

## of the

## U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs

May 23-24, 2016

## Pentagon Conference Center

Washington, D.C.

#### COMMISSIONERS PARTICIPATING ON THE U.S. SIDE:

General Robert "Doc" Foglesong USAF (ret), U.S. Chairman

Senator Joe Manchin (D-WV)

Congressman Tim Walz (D-MN)

Mr. Michael Linnington, Director, Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA)

Deputy Assistant Secretary Kathleen Kavalec, Department of State

Dr. Tim Nenninger, National Archives and Records Administration

Mr. Tim Shea, Defense Intelligence Officer, Defense Intelligence Agency

Dr. James G. Connell Jr., Acting Executive Secretary, U.S. Side

#### COMMISSIONERS PARTICIPATING ON THE RUSSIAN SIDE:

General-Colonel Valeriy A. Vostrotin, Chairman of the Russian Union of the public associations of the airborne troops veterans "Union of the Russian Paratroopers" - Co-Chairman of the Russian Side of the U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs (further named as Commission)

General-Colonel Aleksandr V. Kirilin, Assistant to the Deputy Minister of Defense, Deputy Co-Chairman of the Russian Side of the Commission

Colonel (ret.) Andrey L. Taranov, Deputy Director, Russian MOD Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Motherland and Executive Secretary of the Russian Side of the Commission

Colonel Eduard A. Paderin, Chief of the Archive Service of the Russian Armed Forces

Colonel (ret.) Nikolay I. Nikiforov, Deputy Chief for Scientific Research, Institute of Military History, Military Academy of the General staff of the Russian Armed Forces

General-Lieutenant Vasiliy S. Khristoforov, Chief of the Department of Registration and Archival Funds of the Russian Federal Security Service

Ms. Iolanta V. Mikhaylova, Director of the non-government Agency "Russian Red Cross Research and Information," public organization

Admiral Vladimir P. Komoedov, Chief of the State Duma Defense Committee

## OPENING SESSION, 1000, 23 MAY 2016

Also present from the United States:

COL Christopher Forbes, Director, Europe-Mediterranean, DPAA

Mr. Richard Lyda, Chief, Joint Commission Support, DPAA

MAJ James Harvey, Chief, DPAA Moscow Office

MSG Michael Arrowsmith, DPAA

MSG Michael Amrhein, DPAA

MSgt Scott Erwin, DPAA

MSgt Timothy Kimbrell, DPAA

Dr. Nicole Eilers, DPAA

Dr. Stephen Johnson, DPAA

Mr. Matthew Kristoff, DPAA

Mr. Dan Baughman, DPAA

Lt Col Steven Sampson, DPAA

Maj Craig Cherek, DPAA

Maj Shannon Coleman, DPAA

Dr. Vladislav Sorokin, DPAA Moscow Office

Ms. Irina Koryakina, DPAA Moscow Office

Mr. Mikhail Smolyaninov, DPAA Moscow Office

Mr. Ted Antsiferov, Department of State (DOS) Interpreter

Mr. Kahren Mkrtchyan, DOS Interpreter

Also present from the Russian Federation:

Colonel Yuriy V. Kargin, Chief, International Affairs Section, Russian MOD Directorate for Perpetuating the Memory of Fallen Defenders of the Motherland Lt Col (ret.) Maxim Nikolayevich Alexeyev, Chief, Washington office of the Russian Side

Ms. Galina Alekseyevna Ivleva, Deputy Chief, Washington office of the Russian Side Ms. Natalia Alekseyevna Dementieva, Cultural Attache, Russian Embassy Washington Mr. Kutsuk Kazbekovich Taysaev, Assistant Cultural Attache, Russian Embassy Washington

General Foglesong: It is 0955, and I would like to call the Jubilee 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum of the U.S.-Russia Joint Commission on POW/MIAs to order. It is my great pleasure to welcome you to Washington, D.C. The last Plenum, the 19<sup>th</sup>, was held 28-29 June 2005 in Moscow. The last Plenum in Washington, the 11<sup>th</sup> was held 7-9 December in Washington. I want to keep my remarks short so we can get into working groups soonest. But, first, I would like to call on Mr. Rich Lyda, Chief of Joint Commission Support in the Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency (DPAA) to make some administrative and housekeeping remarks.

**Mr. Lyda:** [Administrative remarks, such as the location of restrooms, smoking area, and arrangements for lunch in the Air Force Mess].

**General Foglesong:** There is no doubt that we are better together than apart. This is the most energy I have seen on the commission in my ten years as U.S. chairman. I hope we can use this momentum to make significant progress and "catch the wave." Now I would like to ask the members of the U.S. Side of the Commission to introduce themselves and make a few remarks.

**Senator Manchin (D-WV):** I am very glad the Plenum is meeting after 11 years. The American people support this Commission and its mission. I would like to thank the Russian side for your participation in the Commission. It is good that our Commission has a firm legal footing in the diplomatic note of 6 July 2009 exchanged by Presidents Obama and Medvedev that established the participants on the Russian side and set administrative rules for the commission. This is one of the most prestigious commissions that I have served on. I would like to propose a toast that "there are long ships and tall ships, but no ship like friendship....so may we always be friends."

**Representative Walz (D-MN):** Thank you for honoring our dead at Arlington National Cemetery this morning [The Russian delegation laid a wreath at the Tomb of the Unknown Soldier earlier.] Thank you on behalf of the families of southern Minnesota who are still waiting to learn the fate of their loved ones.

**Mr. Linnington:** There is no greater service than to lay one's life down for one's country. We have about 650 civilian and military personnel at DPAA dedicated to the mission of fullest possible accounting from past conflicts from WWII to the present. I very much look forward to the work of this Commission.

**Secretary Kavalec:** I have worked on U.S./Russian relations for most of my career. This Commission was founded near the beginning of my career back in 1992. It says something that it is still meeting. On behalf of the U.S. Department of State, welcome to the United States.

**Mr. Shea:** I serve as the senior advisor to the Defense Intelligence Agency on questions about Eurasia. This is my first meeting with the Commission. Our relationship may be complicated, but we can still cooperate on this issue. As an intelligence officer, it is my job to say little, but listen a lot.

**Dr. Nenninger:** I have been associated with the Commission in some capacity or another since 1992 beginning with supporting the Acting Archivist of the United States Trudy Huskamp Peterson, who was the NARA representative on the Commission. It has been my pleasure to work with Mr. Alexeyev in helping him begin his research in the German Trophy documents in College Park.

**MAJ Harvey:** My last nine months in the position of DPAA liaison at American Embassy Moscow have been both exciting and motivating. I would like to take this opportunity to introduce my Russian colleagues who work in our Moscow office, Dr. Slava Sorokin, Ms. Irina Koryakina, and Mr. Misha Smolyaninov.

General Foglesong: Thank you very much. I am happy with the progress in the Commission and I thank the representatives of the Department of Defense for the expenditure of resources and the provision of people for this mission of past conflict personnel accounting. As I stated earlier, we are better together. And we do not want to wait another ten years before our next meeting. Now I would like to give the floor to General Vostrotin for his remarks and introductions.

**General Vostrotin:** It is a great pleasure to be here in the Capital. We believe that the culture of a family can be found in the kitchen, but the culture of a nation can be found in its cemeteries. Next year – the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of this commission – should have its own medallion or commemorative medal struck. The work of this commission is not in vain. I would now like to introduce the Russian members of the commission:

**Admiral Komoedov:** I would like to note that when we pass away, only our relatives' memory of us remains. But in the big collective memory of Russia, nothing and no one is forgotten. I would hope that here I, too, can listen more than speak.

General Kirilin: I would like to note that even though there have been no plenary sessions for a while, our work has been ongoing. Every POW/MIA request submitted by the U.S. side to the Russian Ministry of Defense (MOD) has been received and addressed. We consider this to be a very noble mission. Based on our visit to Arlington National Cemetery this morning, and earlier visits, we are convinced that Russia should have the same type of cemetery. Thus, in 2013, a Russian federal cemetery similar to Arlington was commissioned. I would like to wish the Commission all success, and we would like to see you in Moscow.

**General Vostrotin:** I would like to relate a brief anecdote. Not everyone gets to lie in the new cemetery mentioned by General Kirilin. Only Heroes of the Soviet Union/Russian Federation,

General-Colonels and higher, ministers and prime ministers can be buried there. I used to be an assistant to the Russian Minster of Defense. I once remarked to the minister that we would be neighbors, since we would be buried in the same cemetery. How important and touching it was to visit Arlington National Cemetery.

**Colonel Nikiforov:** Finally, we can start the practical part on what we have worked on for the past ten years. I would like to thank our predecessors on the USRJC and those newly arrived to the Commission for their work; as for me, I am happy to be here. I believe the WWII Working Group provides the fundamental basis for the Commission and its very noble mission. I hope the WWII working group will be worthy of this noble mission.

**Colonel Paderin:** The work of our commission is the same as the work of our Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense. Our work must be much broader than just the Vietnam War. One of the main tasks of the archives is to preserve documents and make them available for study. The goal of this effort is to perpetuate memory. We work on a daily basis with many other parties in addition to researchers from the Commission. I would like to say on behalf of the archives of the Russian Ministry of Defense, we are happy to help.

**General Khristoforov:** I have great interest in military history, and in the wars in Korea, Vietnam, and Afghanistan. I served in Afghanistan for three years and three months – so this is a special war for me. I served as a counter intelligence officer – so I will speak less and listen more to the chairman – then ask General Vostrotin to assign someone to actually speak. To tell the truth, I am surprised I actually got a visa [joke – laughter].

**Ms. Mikhajlova:** My organization, the <u>Russian Red Cross</u>, was created in March of 1945. My office works to try to restore family links lost since the time of WWII. I hope that our joint work on the Commission will help these families who do not have memories of other members of their own families.

General Vostrotin: All those present on the Russia side of the USRJC have PhD's and/or are scientists. All members of the Russian delegation will work very hard. While each side works on its own, I echo General Foglesong by saying that we can do better when we work together. Despite challenges, we have completed 19 plenary sessions of the USRJC. Today begins the 20<sup>th</sup> session. I would like to mention some of our past achievements. The Russian Side has provided assistance to the U.S. side on WWII questions. Hundreds of documents from Russian archives have been found about Soviet forces helping to heal wounded U.S. personnel in WWII in Soviet hospitals. I would also like to note the assistance provided to find the wreckage of a U.S. plane from WWII on the Kamchatka Peninsula. The Russian Federation assisted on the mission in Hungary to disinter a group unknown burial, and the remains of a U.S. service member were identified and returned to the U.S. The American movie, *Saving Private Ryan*, shows that a military operation to save one soldier is worth it – so 25 years of work to find the remains of even one U.S. soldier is worth it. In 2009, the U.S. received from Russia copies of captured

German documents, given to President Obama from Russia about a missing U.S. pilot. I understand how the people of the United States remember the Korean War. Our activity in the Korean War was classified in Russia for a time, but now we know more about our own participation. Russia gave the U.S. access from 1997-2006, and again in January of 2010, to archives of the Soviet fighter aviation corps that operated in Korea during the Korean War so the U.S. can find information about U.S. aircraft lost during the conflict. Information is important, and Russia responds positively to archival requests, even for data about POW/MIA personnel. This topic used to be classified. Russia has made a huge effort, but maybe this is still not enough. More than 1000 former Russian soldiers, veterans of the Korean War, have been interviewed about the Korean War.

With respect to the Cold War, documents related to the shoot downs of U.S. aircraft by Soviet air defense forces have been shared. Photos taken on the ground (by search groups) have confirmed the deaths of U.S. air crewmen. At a crash site in Armenia, evidence was collected that confirmed that all 17 U.S. crew members died. Also, information has been shared about a RB-47 aircraft shot down over the Barents Sea in 1960. Support has also been provided about a missing American pilot in the vicinity of the Kurile Islands.

Excerpts from 335 previously classified, and now declassified, documents have been provided related to U.S. servicemen who were shot down over Vietnam. Former Soviet servicemen (hundreds of them who served in Vietnam during the Vietnam War) have been interviewed for information.

Russia is happy with the commitment of the U.S. side of the USRJC to provide documents about WWII. In the Korean War, the U.S. side has helped Russia determine the fate of some of its own pilots who fought with North Korea. U.S. servicemen have also been interviewed to help find lost Soviet personnel in Korea. The U.S. also has provided information about the K-129 (Soviet Golf II class ballistic missile diesel submarine) that sunk in 1968.

I would like to laud the work of Lieutenant Colonel (ret.) Maxim Nikolayevich Alexeyev (Russian USRJC representative in DC). I express my gratitude to the U.S. side for helping the Russian liaison. A full-fledged exchange of officers is good. The Russian Side has learned a lot from visits to Russia by members of the U.S. delegation.

**Lieutenant Colonel Alexeyev:** I would like to welcome all my colleagues to the Plenum. Thank you to the U.S. side for their openness and transparency. The Russia Liaison Office to the USRJC opened last year. I would like to emphasize that our missing service members did their best – so we on the Commission must do our best.

**Mr. Linnington:** It has been a joy to work with Maxim since he opened the Russian office last July.

**General Foglesong:** Thank you very much, Colonel Alexeyev. I would now like to ask Dr. James Connell, Acting Executive Secretary of the U.S. Side, to address the plenum.

**Dr. Connell:** It is a great honor for me to be here, as this is my 17<sup>th</sup> plenum of the USRJC. Fifteen of the 17 plenums I have attended have been in Moscow. In 1992 when we opened the Embassy Moscow office of the U.S. Side of the USRJC, no one could conceive that we would still be working. On the way to the cemetery, Gen Vostrotin mentioned that some of the graves at Arlington were due to the work of the USRJC. He spoke of Captain John Dunham, a 1950 Naval Academy graduate whose remains were recovered from the Kurile Islands. He also spoke of the 17 U.S. aircrew members who were recovered from a site in Armenia from a crash in 1958. He also mentioned the remains from a WWII USN PV-1 crash in Kamchatka Peninsula – seven sets of remains from that incident are buried in Arlington. General Vostrotin noted how the U.S. side has worked to provide Russian access to captured German documents from WWII, and the commission's work to try to find information on the 264 Soviet soldiers still missing from the war in Afghanistan. By working through the U.S. Naval History and Heritage Command, we have succeeded in providing information about Soviet air crashes at sea in the vicinity of U.S. Navy ships. In concluding, I would like to pay tribute to former members of the USRJC who have passed away after making enormous contributions to our work: Ambassador Toon, General Volkogonov, Colonel Orlov, and Admiral Novyv.

**General Vostrotin:** We are standing on a solid legacy and foundation. By order of the Russian President, the work of this Presidential commission is subordinate to the Russian Ministry of Defense for its support. Thanks to the Russian government for enabling this commission.

**Admiral Komoedov:** I would like to provide some new information. Off the Kamchatka Peninsula, near the Kurile Islands, Russia has used side scan sonar to explore a U.S. submarine from WWII – the USS *Herring* (SS-233 – a *Gato* class submarine). A crew of 83 persons was on board. The submarine is believed to lie at a depth of about 100 meters. This would not be difficult to search. We will continue to investigate the loss of the *USS Herring*. We believe it was sunk in WWII by the 52<sup>nd</sup> Japanese Coastal Battery. We will ask Japan for more information. The location is in the vicinity of Matua Island.

General Kirilin: In the archives, we have found a new document. On May 11, 1945 at 2119 (Local), a U.S. B-25 Mitchell bomber made an emergency landing at Yelizovo military airport near Petropavlovsk-Kamchatsky on the Kamchatka Peninsula. The tail number was 30033158. A shell had hit the middle of the fuselage and exploded. The radio and gun sights were destroyed. The radio operator died and the gunner was wounded. It is reported that the radioman was buried near the airport. This is a good lead, and we will search for the burial site.

**Dr. Connell:** It is interesting that on our ride in a Mi-8 helicopter to investigate the USN PV-1 crash site in 2000, we left from this same Yelizovo airfield, which is now the Petropavlovsk-Kamchatsky municipal airport.

General Foglesong: Thank you very much. These are two exciting opportunities for us.

## Group breaks for lunch in the Air Force Executive Dining Hall

## WWII Working Group session, 1300-1600, 23 May 2016

In attendance: Commissioners Tim Nenninger (U.S. Side, National Archives and Records Administration, NARA); COL (ret) Nikolay I. Nikiforov (Russian Side, Research Institute of the Military Academy of the General Staff, Armed Forces of the Russian Federation); Col-Gen Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin, (Russian side, Chairman of the Commission); Iolanta V. Mikhajlova, Russian side, Tracing and Information Center of the Russian Red Cross); Richard Lyda (DPAA); COL Christopher Forbes (DPAA). General-Colonel (retired) Aleksandr Valentinovich Kirilin was also present for part of the session. Dr. Nicole Eilers (DPAA); Lt Col (ret.) Maxim Alexeyev (Chief, DC office of the Russian side of the Commission); Mikhail Smolyaninov (DPAA Office, Moscow); Lt Col Steve Sampson (DPAA); MAJ Shannon Coleman (DPAA); Dr. Stephen Johnson (DPAA); two DOS interpreters

Colonel Nikiforov: As I mentioned this morning, it is an honor and a privilege to be here. I would like to begin by noting that we have previously been asked to work on "List #7" which is part of the declassified Soviet Order of Battle during the war. List #7 is a part of the Order of Battle, "Combined Arms Brigades that saw action during the Great Patriotic War, 1941-1945." The difficulties working with this Electronic Order of Battle (EOB) come from the large number of units associated with the Russian Army. The Russian side of the Commission is ready to help and to make sense of it, though. If we can use this knowledge about military units to help us find missing U.S. soldiers, we would like to help.

I would like to clarify the term "active/acting Army." It refers to all military units that took part in military action. The List #7 comprised all of these units. The Soviet system was very different than the German system. A Soviet Division = 6-8,000 men; # of units involved as of 22 June [1941] were 184 Divisions in the Soviet Military. By 9 May [1945], this number had been increased to 1,000 Divisions. If/when a division lost 50% of its people, it was reorganized.

The results of all this information will soon be published under "Active Duty Army" series. The publication run will be very limited, and not sold in stores, but we will share this information with the U.S. Side of the Commission at the DPAA Moscow Office. There will be five volumes committed to Division commanders alone—3,000 officers in command during the war. When putting this together, the authors considered also the combat histories of units. Possibly this can be used to cross-reference which Soviet division was in the area where an American was killed.

Next, our military historians are working on the Brigade Commander Division, too, which is one level below the Division Commander level. By the end of the war, there were only ten "fronts" in the European Theater. They included: armored divisions; AAF armies; combat engineer

armies; and assault brigades; and etc. By 1943, many had already been dismantled or decommissioned.

**Dr. Nenninger:** Thank you very much for that interesting presentation. Turning in a slightly different direction, the U.S. Side of the WWII Working Group, had three principle areas for discussion, and you have just covered one of them. Thank you. How detailed is this unit information? Are these day-to-day chronicles and records, or at a more general level?

Colonel Nikiforov: It depends on the unit and the record set. Sometimes there is a lot of detail present, maybe not at the day-to-day level, but still a lot of detail, even toward the end of the war. Also, they have some Trophy Documents. There are also maps. At the Russian Military State Archive, there are Trophy Document maps. The authors also have the ability to check with other governments and archives about Trophy Documents, as they have been working on this topic. For example, they work with Col Mack from the German Zentrum fuer Militaergeschichte und Sozialwissenschaften der Bundeswehr [likely Oberst Dr. Hans-Hubertus Mack at the Center for Military History and Social Sciences of the German Army; DPAA historians Dr. Eilers and Dr. Rodriguez recently met with researchers from this Center in January 2016].

**Dr. Nenninger:** The other two areas/topics of interest we want to discuss today are American POWs and aircraft losses [in territory formerly controlled/held by the Soviet Union].

Colonel Nikiforov: And this also includes the air route from Alaska to Siberia, yes? This is still not finalized. As for the Concentration Camps and POWs, this would be easy to find out which unit would have liberated a particular camp. As for lost aircraft, this is more challenging. We keep asking for coordinates from you, where was the plane lost? Otherwise it is hard to sort out the information from people who say, yes, a plane went down here or there. Sorting through all of this is how we came up with information previously supplied today about the B-25 at Yelizovo. Matching this information will help us to hone in on the right plane—is this the one you are interested in? Or is it a different plane? This way, we can jointly analyze information, together. When it is time for follow-up work, then we can also come to an agreement for the next steps.

**Dr. Nenninger:** What about records of units that are not front line combat units, but rear-area units. What kind of access do you have to those?

Colonel Nikiforov: All this work is being done jointly with the archives; we have had very good relationship with the archives. They should be able to provide finding aids for these units, and all should be declassified except for some things dealing with mobilization and readiness, and also morale and living conditions. It would help if the US side could be specific and pinpoint a particular unit of interest. Also, many WWII documents are already uploaded to the website of the Ministry of Defense. Documents are the muscles behind the ideas. There are also possibly helpful documents in records from units engaged in mop-up operations, as the front line was moving. As for POWs and camps, there are many units that could be involved. It would help if

the Russian side knew which camps the U.S. side is interested in that were under the Soviet area and liberated. Does the U.S. side have numbers, etc?

**Mr. Lyda:** Stalag 3C is definitely one such camp. We are missing still 10-13 from this camp. It is not entirely clear to the U.S. side, however, which Russian units were there, as there were several in the area around that time, crossing paths. We would like to work together to find this information, if possible.

**Colonel Nikiforov:** Start with an official request. State, we are interested in XXX camp. Then we can work it from there.

**Dr. Nenninger:** There are, I believe, 21 German camps that we are interested in. We have a list. Have you already seen that list?

Colonel Nikiforov, now joined by General Vostrotin: No. We do not have that list. We should start trading information. I would like to discuss what we, the Russian Side, are interested in. We are interested in Soviet citizens in Axis areas, not just military personnel, though. We want information on the composition and numbers of Soviet forces involved in WWII as we are tracking it, and also the U.S. perspective (as recorded in the archival record) of Soviet Military forces, actions, performance, etc. Also, we are very interested in materials you may have about Operation Unthinkable, and also any material addressing the fear of a Soviet attack, and historic information about what Britain had planned to do if the Soviet Union attacked. Do you have any information on this topic? Providing this would be great for cooperation.

**Dr. Nenninger:** These are interesting questions, indeed. All of this can at least be partly researched, openly, at NARA.

**Colonel Nikiforov:** (jokingly) We want you to do the research for us!

**Dr. Nenninger:** This type of information would be present not just in the military records, but also in State Department records, and possibly other record groups as well. Many of these documents and collections have been declassified since the 1970s.

General Kirilin: Getting back to the question of POWs, we did look at some trophy documents for information on POWs in German camps. The Russian side is digitizing and making a database on this subject, and will return to the US Side any documents they find re: U.S. POWs. This is part of the Ministry of Defense information on Soviet POWs we are interested in. Analysis of some lists shows that some are still listed as MIA, some 800,000 to 1 million [Soviets]. Does the U.S. have information about them?

**Dr. Nenninger:** It is challenging to research that type of topic at NARA, because our data is just not organized that way. Perhaps 10 men will be named in a document, then there may be 600 pages of documents that are on a completely different topic, and then only 600 pages later there

could be mention of another 5 Russian POWs. So, one must go through the whole file to know if there is information there.

**General Vostrotin:** Is NARA interested in digitizing documents? Could Russian researchers come digitize documents?

**Dr. Nenninger:** In theory, yes, we have some space at NARA for researchers. We should talk more about this. It would help to know who you are trying to find, who is your target audience, etc.? It sounds like the Russian interests are broader than just Red Army personnel, yes?

**General Kirilin:** We work for the relatives of the missing and former prisoners. They want to know what happened, but there are also questions involving possible compensation for forced service and imprisonment, which require knowing for sure where prisoners were held captive.

**Colonel Nikiforov:** We should first make a letter of intention, have the lawyers look at it, and think about issues of PII, etc. We are a government entity, and must do things carefully.

**Dr. Nenninger:** I wonder if the Russian Side could talk a bit more about your efforts to consolidate and reorganize the archives in Podolsk. We understand that you were consolidating records about WWII and bringing documents from other locations to one central location in Podolsk. We would like to know how that process is coming along, and at what stage you are at, etc.

**Colonel Nikiforov:** About consolidation, yes, the process is ongoing. I suggest that we should hear from our colleague, Colonel Paderin, in another session on the subject, because he knows much more. I suggest that we open the session tomorrow with a short presentation on the matter. In general, though, the main issue is about "ownership" of the archive once reorganization takes place—to which government entity will this archive belong? There are some regulatory issues that have not yet been solved. We will hear of this tomorrow.

[The session ended, with an agreement that there would be more about the Podolsk archives and consolidation the following day].

## WWII Working Group Session, 1000-1200, 24 May 2016

In attendance: Commissioners Dr. Tim Nenninger (U.S. Side, National Archives and Records Administration); Col (ret) Nikolay Ivanovich Nikiforov (Russian Side, Research Institute of the Military Academy of the General Staff, Armed Forces of the Russian Federation); Gen-Col Valeriy Aleksandrovich Vostrotin, (Russian Side Chairman); Iolanta V. Mikhajlova, Russian Side, Tracing and Information Center of the Russian Red Cross); Mr. Richard Lyda (DPAA); COL Christopher Forbes (DPAA). Colonel Eduard Abramovich Paderin (Chief, Archival Service, of the Armed Forces of the Russian Federation) was also present for the beginning part of the session.

Also in attendance: Dr. Nicole Eilers (DPAA); Mr. Mikhail Smolyaninov (DPAA Moscow Office); Maxim N. Alexeyev (Washington office of the Russian side of the Commission); LTC Steve Sampson (DPAA); Dr. Stephen Johnson (DPAA); Two DOS interpreters

**Colonel Paderin:** I would like to give an update on the reorganization and consolidation of WWII materials in Podolsk. The documents, especially WWII documents, are currently located at many different archives throughout the Russian Federation. The central archive holds documents from 1941 and later, mostly those created during the active Army stage, during WWII, and post-war period for the Soviet Army and Russian Liberation. Earlier documents for the period of 1938 and 1939, and also the Finnish war, are instead housed at the State Archives of the Russian Federation (GARF). The idea to create one WWII archive dates back to 2009, and the idea was to build it at Podolsk, which is not far from Moscow. Subsequently, it was decided that the archives would be under the Ministry of Defense. Currently, the compound is being built. The documents are currently being stored and therefore they belong to the Russian Federation. Then, they will return them to the state for further storage (which is mandated by a specific period of time) for 75 years. This issue of storage period is when it starts to have an impact on the WWII documents, and who "owns" them. Some documents are fragile and should not be moved from Podolsk. The idea is to collect other relevant documents from all over and centralize them in that archive, but it has not actually begun. It is a good idea, and I hope it will occur in the future.

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, upon agreement, the documents stayed where they were in the various newly-created states. This applies more to postwar documents. Some of the military documents are at St. Petersburg, but they will be relocated to Podolsk. There is a distinction between an Agency Archive, and a State Archive. To date, there is no plan or movement to combine the two. Once built, the new facility will be an agency archive. The original idea was to run it as a State Archive. There is a presidential decree about digitization and posting documents on their website, and this has let them (the Agency) keep the records for an additional 25 years while they digitize them, as opposed to turning them over after 75 years, as is usual. This should not impede our (DPAA) access, except for things that are State Secrets and therefore not accessible.

There is also an archive in Moscow, that has documents about Russian social history, and much of this information is already posted on the internet. Also, there is some information that may be located in the State Archives of the Russian Federation (GARF). Thank you for your attention, and I will now return to my regularly-assigned Vietnam War Working Group.

**Dr. Nenninger:** We also want to discuss an unanswered question/topic from the last plenum, to follow-up on a particular case that we asked about before. There is a B-26 Bomber on/near the Bering Straits. We seek your help to find any additional information on this matter. Maybe the records would be at the Central Archives of the Border Guards, or, perhaps, at a civilian agency, like the records for Kamchatka or another Aleutian area agency?

**Colonel Nikiforov:** It is always difficult to rely on eyewitness statements alone. I would need more information, concrete information, like the date and time of the incident, and etc. DPAA should re-submit a request with more details, and we will inquire to the different archives accordingly. The more information you give us, the better; then our researchers can do a better job.

**Colonel Forbes**: I would like to explain how DPAA has reorganized, and give the Russian side some context about our mission, and how we operate, etc. (Explanation followed).

**Ms. Mikhajlova:** Please permit me to give a brief explanation about the Tracing and Information Center of the Russian Red Cross and their work. The Center was created in March 1945 by a government decree. It is part of the Central Bureau on Displaced Persons. It was tasked to reunite families, mark the graves of Soviet personnel, find information on the fates of Soviet personnel, and to find the fates of Soviet citizens who were taken and made forced laborers and prisoners.

Prior to 1992, the Center served all of the Soviet Union. Currently, it only services Russia; now other former Soviet states have their own tracing services. Approximately 15 million documents are in the Center archives. These are documents on displaced persons; evacuees; orphans (including those that were orphaned by Stalin's purges and vast imprisonments); and card files, which are not digitized. Currently, they are discussing digitization of the displaced persons archives, because the cards also hold information on relocated POWs. In 1992, they transferred a lot of these cards to the Ministry of Defense.

The Center responds to requests from families and also from foreign entities, as appropriate. It is partnered with other Red Cross agencies throughout the world, in particular the one in Bad Arolsen, Germany. Most of the tracing questions it researches now are related to WWII losses and disappearances. The other large part of what it does is related to the care of and information about War Graves. The Embassy issues Visas, free, for families to visit the war graves of their loved ones. They must have confirmation of a headstone, etc., to do this, though. They have lists, and must verify and also answer questions about the War Graves.

The Center also works on more modern tracing cases. For example, questions about children missing from terrorist attacks and migrant or refugee families that have missing family members provide cases that need tracing service help. Russia currently is the second largest acceptor of migrants in the world (after the U.S.), and there are a lot of special challenges to tracing migrants. Finally, their last duty is to assist with cases of children abandoned in Russia.

In 2015, the Center processed over 29,000 requests. Some are much more complex than others. With more time, I could give anecdotal examples of the various aforementioned types of cases we have worked on in the past.

At the Tracing Center, we are very happy to have access to the American Archives, especially for the captured German records you have here.

Mr. Lyda: I should mention that Dr. Edward Burton, a historian in the European-Mediterranean Directorate of DPAA, had been conducting research and believes he has found four Soviet airmen that are currently buried as American unknowns at the Ardennes American Cemetery (Neuville) in Belgium. The Germans who occupied Norway in 1944 assumed the remains were American since it was an American plane, the crew wore U.S. uniforms, and the plane was loaded with scarce WWII goods like nylon stockings and chocolate. After the war, the remains were finally buried in Belgium. [The Russian Side of the plenum was visibly moved and very pleased with this information. Both sides agreed to follow up and decide how to proceed in the future on the matter. Lyda promised to supply the Russian side with a written document about the case in the near future, and that coordination could proceed from that point.]

[The session ended with all parties agreeing that there is a great opportunity for collaboration in the future and the sharing of information on both sides.]

[After the session had officially ended, Dr. Eilers approached Mikhajlovna (and also a translator) to ask some follow up questions about the Tracing Center, which there had not been an opportunity to ask during the actual session. During a recent research trip to the Bundesarchiv-Lichterfelde, located outside Berlin, Germany, Dr. Eilers and Dr. Robyn Rodriguez saw a number of documents from the early days of this tracing service that are located at that archive from the immediate post-war years (the Bundesarchiv-Lichterfelde is the German federal archive that holds, among other things, records from the former East Germany.). This archive also holds a number of records about War Graves in the former East Germany. Many of these records are about Soviet War Dead, but they also include information about American war dead as well. Here, Dr. Eilers briefly described some of the War Graves and Tracing Service records that she had seen there, to confirm that this was indeed a collection that the Tracing Center was aware of (they are). Then, Dr. Eilers explained that in their experience, they often saw only one side of a correspondence between East German officials and officials in the Soviet Union. Does the Tracing Center have the other side of that correspondence, or has Mikhajlovna ever seen anything like what Dr. Eilers has described? Mikhajlovna answered that, unfortunately, the Center only has the cards from that era on the missing and the searching. They do not have any correspondence like that which Dr. Eilers has described. They only keep things like correspondence for 30 years; they do not have much space, so they do not have anything that old. Perhaps another archive does. In her work with the Center, they only correspond with other Red Cross and Tracing Service agencies, so she does not know. At this statement, Dr. Eilers asked if she would like to be alerted to Soviet POWs or forced laborers' graves or other information, if Dr. Eilers ran across such information during her work in foreign (particularly German) archives. Such information would be welcomed].

[Finally, also after the official session had ended, Dr. Eilers had a follow-up conversation (begun the previous day during a break) with Mikhail Smolyaninov of the DPAA Moscow Office about Trophy Documents in Russian Archives. Dr. Eilers had expressed great interest in the documents that Soviet forces had gathered as they pressed through German territory. Additionally, there could be documents from the post-war years about the Army Graves Registration Command [AGRC] searches in the Eastern Bloc territories that could pertain to unaccounted-for Americans. He provided her with a reference to a home page where one can search the collections: http://guides.rusarchives.ru/Browse/guidebook.htm?bid=123 [This does not seem to work on office computers; try http://guides.rusarchives.ru] Here, one can find information about captured records, or Trophy Documents, that they hold. These are not just limited to records about German areas and cases, but also contain information and documentation on Operation Frantic (Ploesti, Romania)].

## Korean War Working Group Session, 1300-1600, 23 May 2016

Present: Mr. Linnington, Admiral Komoedov, General Kirilin, Colonel Taranov, Colonel Paderin, Mr. Dan Baughman, MAJ Harvey, MSgt Kimbrell, Dr. Sorokin (Interpreter).

Mr. Linnington: Thank you for coming. Congressman Johnson is not well and had to excuse himself. The Korean War families are the most vocal and many family members believe that their missing loved one is still alive. Quite a few family members are upset that we, DPAA, cannot provide information about their loved one. The US has 7800 still missing with 5300 in North Korea, 1300 in the lab or in our cemeteries, and 800 to 1000 in South Korea scattered around the battlefield. Because we cannot get into North Korea to excavate, the only thing that we can give the families at times is information. We are so thankful for what you have provided us. We need as much information as we can possibly get because that is all the families will get unless things change with North Korea. We have been to North Korea 33 times, but not since 2005.

**Admiral Komoedov**: I have considered all materials. I was shocked at U.S. losses, especially those figures for North Korea. The situation in North Korea may change for the better. We have someone with access to North and South Korea. He is a Russian Duma Deputy of Korean ancestry, and could be available to assist the US. The assistance that we can provide could be significant. Our relations with North Korea can be controversial. Their leader is very unpredictable, and we cannot forecast his behavior. General Kirilin and Colonel Taranov are very experienced.

**Mr. Linnington**: Dan Baughman has been working Korea since 1994. We do family meetings all over the country with the last one in Boston just a couple of weeks ago. Dan could write 10 books on Korea and his knowledge is great.

**Admiral Komoedov**: Question to ask...You have received remains from North Korea. When did you receive remains and who was the leader?

**Mr. Linnington**: We just returned 15 remains to South Korea. Those remains were in the lab and were previously received from the North Koreans. We knew the remains were South Korean after conducting DNA tests on them. The South Koreans returned 2 sets of remains that they recovered in the DMZ in December. We and South Korea work closely, but we have no contacts in North Korea.

**Mr. Baughman**: The first excavation in North Korea was in July 1996. This effort spanned 10 years till May 2005. [Shows excavations areas on fabric map of North Korea] Kim Jong II was in charge at the time and the remains were located in Unsan, Kunu Ri, and Chosin. We did a total of 33 missions.

**Mr. Linnington**: We did a total of 33 separate missions/trips to North Korea spending \$19 million dollars.

**General Kirilin**: What was the composition of the groups?

**Mr. Baughman**: 30+ people with a 13 man team at Unsan and 14 men at Chosin. We had 2 people in Pyongyang. They typically came through Beijing, but also Panmunjon.

**General Kirilin**: How did they search?

**Mr. Baughman**: Metal detectors and war records. Down to 10 meters.

**General Kirilin**: Remains on the battlefield?

**Mr. Linnington**: Yes, on the battlefield. In 2011, we met with North Korea in Bangkok with a plan formulated to return in 2012. We shipped equipment and sent a team to Beijing. Kim Jongil suddenly died, and we were not allowed back in. The equipment is still in South Korea. We know where the soldiers are lying and where the POW camps are. We just need to get to them.

**Colonel Taranov**: Is there access to the camps by the Red Cross?

**Mr. Baughman**: No. When we negotiate with North Korea about access, we send them a list and they decide where we go. [There was a brief discussion of two specific POW camps to give an example of how many US POW's died]. The North Koreans looked for witnesses such as farmers who might have hit bones with their plows. They would then tell us about where the bones were.

**Colonel Taranov**: Has the North Korean Army or any other organization collected information for you?

Mr. Baughman: We think they (North Korea) have done some work. They want us to succeed.

**Colonel Taranov**: Which organization?

**Mr. Baughman**: 6th Infantry and 8th Infantry Division soldiers and members of the Armistice Commission. The soldiers act as labor for the mission.

**Mr. Linnington**: At every site we found remains with some on the top of the ground. Some remains came from 100's of miles away. We are sorting all the bones to put them together. The North Koreans gave us 208 sets between 1990 and 1994. We have cut all the bones to test for DNA. We do not have information on our air losses. There are two reasons why the US government will not let us back into North Korea. 1) Security for our teams in North Korea. They just sentenced a US student to 25 years in jail for ripping up a sign. 2) Any money give to North Korea could possibly be used for their nuclear weapons development.

**Admiral Komoedov**: Do they demand payment?

**Mr. Linnington**: Yes, we pay for access and labor. The last mission to North Korea cost approximately \$2.5 million dollars.

**Admiral Komoedov**: Do they request payment for remains?

**Mr. Linnington**: No.

General Kirilin: I have looked through the issue and questions asked by the US Side of the Commission. I see no serious issues with the requests, nor obstacles in replying to the requests. [General Kirilin was referring to issues presented to the Russian Side including Broadened access to the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense at Podolsk, efforts to declassify documents of the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps, access to the files of the Air Force Operational Group and the Main Staff of the Air Forces of the Soviet Army.] We will work with the MoD [Ministry of Defense] including the services that deal with Soviet Topographic maps during the Korean War. The maps are being declassified right now. There might be some technical difficulties and changes to geographical names as well as to some coordinates. The request was sent to the Russian Topographical Service and the response will be forwarded to you. With respect to access to the Central Archives of the Ministry of Defense at Podolsk, we are ready to provide our own personnel to work issues of interest to the U.S. If the information is still classified, they will work on declassification. All or almost all documents in question are past the declassification date. If the documents are not properly marked, problems will occur. Most documents are World War Two era with a directive to declassify. Every page must be reviewed prior to actually declassifying. There is great demand in Russian society for this information. We will work on the 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps at Podolsk for declassification purposes. We promise to do this. You mentioned 78K missing.

**Mr. Linnington**: We have 73K missing from WWII and 7800 from Korea. The majority are in North Korea: 5300; 1300 remains are in our possession and 1000 remains are in South Korea.

General Kirilin: We talked to the North Korean Deputy Chief of Mission [in Moscow] and with the Russian Military Attaché [in Hanoi]. We probed the North Koreans for this information, and they will relay this to their leadership. So far we have received no responses. What about interest in conducting this type of mission through Russia, China, or a Third Party? Only Air Force and AAA units participated in the war. Our losses were very low with 315 KIA and only 33/34 missing. There are shortcomings, discrepancies and confusion in the documentation related to our losses. Although we have a special battalion for searching for our mission, there are no grounds for looking for our losses in North Korea. There is still a way to negotiate for access though payments, but this could be contradictory to US interests. Someone will have to pay. We will initiate discussion with the North Koreans and see what their response is. We talked with the North Korean experts in the Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and just saying "U.S." to North Korea is a red flag. We will keep working the issue. They believe that the situation may change [for the better] in North Korea.

**Mr. Linnington**: We want to be ready if the door cracks open. We need to know exactly where to go with respect to air losses.

General Kirilin: They may be expecting U.S. assistance in other areas.

**Mr. Linnington**: Is there anything we can do to provide information on your Korean losses? We have asked for a lot.

**General Kirilin**: Information on what you found, i.e., what remains and at what grid locations). We will provide information on Soviet citizens who are still missing. We have received 44 names of soldiers who are missing in Hungary [presumably from the 1956 Revolution]. Assistance with other conflicts outside of the USRJC purview would be of interest.

**Colonel Taranov**: I want to mention one more thing. This deals with the reinvigoration of the Veteran's Interview project.

**General Kirilin**: Through interviewing military veterans and commissar organizations, we will find out information for you.

**Mr. Linnington**: Bob Wallace is the #2 in the VFW. He will be happy to hear about the reinvigoration of the Veterans Program.

General Kirilin: Ten years ago, we began discussions with the Chinese about memorials in Port Arthur [now called Dalian]. One memorial was for the Russo-Japanese War and the adjoining memorial was for Soviet troops killed during the Manchurian Campaign and the Korean War. During the 1960's, some of the graves were destroyed and their condition became very bad. We noticed during visits to the naval base there that the memorial was in bad condition. In 2010, we attended the dedication of the restored memorial. There were Russian veterans in attendance,

mostly Korean War veterans. The Russian-Korean Friendship Society provided a list of veterans and this organization could be a source for the Veterans Interview Program.

**Mr. Baughman:** I have been doing this since 1995, and I am not counter-intelligence. I have done the recovery missions and research. I will provide exact numbers recovered at each site with UTM grid coordinates, if desired. We appreciate the map information and access to the Central Archive as these are the types of documents needed (passes examples to General Kirilin and Admiral Komoedov).

Mr. Linnington: We will continue to take advantage of access provided to us at the archives. We have appreciated permission to copy documents. We have tried to accommodate Maxim [Alexeyev]. Two issues for our side: An issue within our own organization is Declassification. We have a mix of Top Secret and Secret as well as Unclassified and Declassified material. It is all mixed up.

**General Kirilin**: Burn before reading (laughing).

Mr. Linnington: We have five years to declassify these documents. We have a presidential order that says any document 25 years or older must be declassified. The exception is that it must be done by the originating agency. Sometimes a single word or single agency causes problems and prevents declassification. Our goal is to declassify for families and put the information on the web. This provides the families the ability to analyze information in addition to our analysts. A challenge for us is our air losses. We do not have enough information. If you cannot be specific, then our families think the worst, especially regarding air losses in the northwest (Mig Alley). The family believes that the member bailed out and survived. Many families believe that their loved one crossed the Yalu River through China and ended up in the Soviet Union. Every week, I answer that question. We have no evidence of POWs taken to the Soviet Union through China. Specific and detailed information on our air losses in the northwest would make it easier to explain to the families. It is very hard to prove that something did not happen (the transfer of U.S. POWs to the Soviet Union).

**Mr. Baughman**: The 64<sup>th</sup> Fighter Aviation Corps files are very helpful. 300+ families have been provided information on their loved ones. We have 900+ Air Force losses in the northwest, and it is these families that are looking for answers [hands over papers detailing US materials from air losses which were in the possession of Soviet forces].

**Mr. Linnington**: These are the most emotional topics when we meet with families, including those Vietnam War losses.

**Colonel Paderin**: [Reviews the papers just handed over and observes that they contain lists of personal artifacts]. The Central Archives in Podolsk does not keep the items mentioned in this list. Maybe there is some possibility of tracking down the items. This document was generated in North Korea.

**Mr. Linnington**: These documents provide answers to families without answers. We know we will not get answers for all the families, but any answer will make a difference. In our own government, we find crash site information in many different locations or sources. Sometimes it is best to provide artifacts of the crash if you cannot provide remains. Some call the Korean War "the Forgotten War" and the families do not like this.

Admiral Komoedov: I am hearing everything. My opinion is to dig deep in the archives. Provide information to the families. We need to clarify rumors about U.S. POWs. It is not completely impossible for a U.S. pilot to be a POW of the North Koreans or Chinese, but needed by the Soviet Union. I am sure that if it happened (transfer to the Soviets), it would have been very, very rare. I am very grateful for your restless heart, and you are a real patriot. We are also. Our relations have reached a certain limit. Sitting here...we understand each other. We need to build up confidence. Normalcy in Europe. Yesterday there were 28 NATO members and today there are 29 members. You need to loosen up about Ukraine. There are options for Crimea, but Crimea will remain Russian. We need to establish a partnership between Russia and the US.

## Korean War Working Group Session (continued): 1000-1200, 24 May 2016

## **Present:**

Mr. Linnington, General Foglesong, Admiral Komoedov, General Kirilin, Colonel Taranov, Colonel Paderin, Mr. Baughman, MAJ Harvey, MSgt Kimbrell, Dr. Sorokin (Interpreter).

Admiral Komoedov: We have discussed the importance of keeping up these meetings and working together. [Komoedov brought up the issue of the American Missile Defense system in Europe and the impact on Russia]. It is apparent from yesterday's discussion that there are some obstacles such as North Korean leadership being unpredictable. Joint efforts will help with that situation. We need to get information to the families, and we need to restore operations of the Commission after a 10-year break. We will make a difference to the families. Our delegation was impressed with family memorials and the wreath-laying service at Arlington Cemetery. Archival records in the U.S. are of great importance to Russia. There are lots of obstacles and technical issues to work through.

**Mr. Linnington**: Our families of our missing are our most important clients. In June, I will meet with 500 family members of the Vietnam War and in August with 500 family members of the Korean War. I will not be able to show them pictures of me with the North Koreans, but I will show them the picture of us working here at the Pentagon. (Mr. Linnington provided the Russians a copy of the DPAA mission brief and went through each slide highlighting significant elements. He went into detail about his last visit to Vietnam and the site that he helped with. He explained our partnership with private organizations.) I invite you to our new facility in Hawaii.

**Admiral Komoedov**: What is the attitude of the Vietnamese?

**Mr. Linnington**: For the young, it is positive, but for the older generation, the attitude is not always positive. There are many issues for them such as losing loved ones, unexploded ordnance, Agent Orange, etc. President Obama is in Vietnam now talking about expanding our efforts as we still have over 1600 missing.

**Mr. Baughman:** You asked for locational data from previous finds in North Korea to 2005. I have a list of all recoveries by province, county and village name with number of recoveries at each site. This number is over 200. We worked in two provinces. The remains recovered were found within 6km of the named village. In the next few weeks, we will send UTM grids that will get the location down to a meter.

**General Kirilin**: You have a meeting with families in June. We will try to make progress by that date. We will try to get you extracted material from the original version of documents. [General Kirilin went on to explain the operations of the 90<sup>th</sup> Specialized Search Battalion outside St Petersburg (Leningrad during WWII). He explained about their search for nearly 300K MIAs and what they go through in trying to locate and identify the remains.

**Mr. Linnington**: [Explained about the family room in Hawaii and how remains are turned over to the family].

**General Kirilin**: Ideally, we would like information on all KIA and the circumstances of their loss. We are hoping to find information on Soviet POW's killed in camps by the Nazis. We want to inform the relatives, and we hope your archives can help.

**Mr. Linnington**: We can help Maxim [Alexeyev] find some of that information. We want Maxim to succeed. There is so much more information.

General Kirilin: [Explained about seeing document that contained information on 4,459,000 Soviet POW's that are MIA. Talked about the number of POW's recovered, the number of displaced citizens that are missing, and those that moved on to places such as Canada, England, the US, etc. He said that General Bulganov had a list from the US Immigration service of 400K former Soviets that immigrated to U.S. after the war]. We do not care where they went; we just want another copy of the list to eliminate them from the total number of MIA's. [Kirilin spoke about other document recovery efforts from WWI and the Napoleonic Wars].

**Mr. Linnington**: I am accountable to my boss, the Under Secretary of Defense for Policy, who works for the Secretary of Defense. I spend lots of time on Capitol Hill. Congress holds the agency accountable, but the families hold us most accountable. For our August meeting, anything that you can provide is excellent.

**General Kirilin**: I talked with Colonel Paderin and asked him about the declassification issue. Information about interrogations was marked Top Secret. The official line was that there was no

Soviet participation during the Korean War. There was NO transfer of US POW's to the Soviets. It was an urban legend.

**Mr. Linnington**: I am happy he said that.

**General Kirilin**: [Discussed Raoul Wallenberg and why the North Koreans, Chinese and Vietnamese didn't want to provide access to the US POW's]. The biggest obstacle to declassification is the regulations that say only the originating agency can declassify.

**Mr. Linnington**: We are going through the same thing now.

**General Kirilin**: We would like to provide information for the August meeting.

**Mr. Linnington**: We did not bring up the issue of U.S. POW's in Soviet hands because there is no credible evidence that this happened.

**Colonel Paderin:** We as Commission members can still extract information from classified documents if it contains material on POW/MIAs. Without breaking the law, we can extract specific information for the Americans. The issue of access is not related to the actual fate of Americans. The U.S. should not have the impression that we are not providing information.

**General Foglesong**: Thank you for the transparency and forthcoming comments. I am proud that both sides are cooperating. This is the most momentum in 10 years.

## VIETNAM WAR WORKING GROUP, 1300-1500, 23 May 2016

#### **Present:**

Rep. Walz, Colonel Paderin, Mr. Kristoff, CDR Knollmueller, Maj Cherek, Mr. Bertocci, two DOS interpreters

**Rep. Walz:** Welcome to the Vietnam War Working Group.

**Colonel Paderin:** I am pleased to serve as the Russian Co-Chair for the VWWG, while, at the same time, manifesting my broader interest as an archivist for the Russian armed forces in this mission.

**Rep. Walz:** As a father and a veteran, trying to bring peace to families of fallen service members is very important to me. We are going to ask sensitive questions, but we do so without any interest in technology or intelligence. We only ask to get information on cases of missing U.S. service members. We would like to discuss access to Vietnam-era Russian documents that are still classified by Russia. We have already received some such documents that were very helpful. We recently looked at documents provided earlier to the USRJC, many of which were useful, though incomplete. This contrasts with information provided by Russia about the Korean War. We believe precedent set by documents released from the Korean War would be of great

benefit. We know from private publications that some [Russian] authors have been given access to such Vietnam era documents. We respectfully request access to those historical publications. For example, on 6 May 2016, a Vietnamese paper published an article that included a paragraph that states "in fact, Soviet divers recovered items from U.S. aircraft shot down over the sea." We believe archived documents from Soviet trawlers [that participated in such operations and likely based in the Pacific – e.g., Vladivostok] may have information of great importance to our mission.

Colonel Paderin: We have had some period of stagnation. Therefore, we have worked with Vietnam era documents less than with Korea era documents. I have only been on the Commission for two years, but since we have precedent [e.g., Korean War era documents], we will work in this direction. As military personnel, we are only the custodians of these documents. We are not at liberty to grant document access to Vietnam War era documents since specific military units might still "own" those documents. The specific military units are not under my jurisdiction. However, our experience shows that those challenges can be overcome.

**Rep. Walz:** I am grateful for that. Our next question is about Soviet recovery teams in Vietnam, researchers from institutes that recovered U.S. technology after battles. From 1965-1974, over 40 Soviet personnel went to North Vietnam [for this purpose]. Russian historical publications claim this group had direct access to U.S. plane crashes in North Vietnam. Can the U.S. side have access to this group's members or its historical documents? We believe Soviet/Russian federation industrial archives and the Politburo archives [now the Presidential Archives] may also have copies [of such documents]. If reports have already been printed, then may the USRJC get copies? We want access to personnel and/or archives for past conflict personnel recovery, not for technical or classified information.

**Colonel Paderin:** This was a group that worked for the intelligence agency. We will approach the intelligence archives with this request. We have an interagency commission that works for the President [of Russia] to declassify these documents. If publications have been made by this group, then it means there has been access to these archives.

**Rep. Walz:** Since the start of the USRJC, we have located and interviewed 410 Soviet veterans from the Vietnam War. From this, we know there were 14,000 Soviet troops and 13,000 Soviet civilians from the USSR in Vietnam during the war. It would help us to get a list of these personnel, and we request your assistance to ask these veterans for help to recover the remains of U.S. service personnel.

**Colonel Paderin:** After the USSR fell apart, only a percentage of these veterans remained in Russia. Others left, or wound up in countries of the former Soviet Union. I do not suspect that we can get much higher than the 410 persons. Many are not with us anymore, but we can work with you in this area.

**Rep. Walz:** We understand, but we would still like your assistance. While we know the interrogation of POWs in Vietnam is a sensitive topic, any information on this that would help us find our personnel would be appreciated.

**Colonel Paderin:** We have different agencies and different archives. Based on what I have seen, I cannot confirm this information. We will try to help.

Rep. Walz: In 1998, personal papers of a Soviet General-Colonel [Dmitriy Antonovich Volkogonov, the first Russian Co-Chair of the USRJC] – this general wrote this in 1994 – revealed that in 1960 a KGB document ordered that Americans be brought to the USSR for intelligence purposes. The general claimed one more sensational document. By the late 1960's, the KGB had the mission to deliver "knowledgeable" Americans to the USSR for interrogation. Was the assigned mission ever carried out? Such a plan seemed to specifically target U.S. POWs. Following the finding of this information, then-Senator Bob Smith started an inquiry. However, the Colonel-General later claimed that Mr. Primakov told him that such a plan did not exist. Ever since, the Russian side [of the USRJC] has denied such a plan existed. However, a former KGB head [Semichastnyy] stated that this *might* have been part of a KGB OPLAN. This Memoir was published in the U.S. in 1998, and has generated much interest, especially among families of the missing. Can the U.S. side of the USRJC have access to these same archives? We only want to put this issue to rest for the families.

**Colonel Paderin:** Are there any confirmations from the U.S. POWs that they were interrogated by the KGB in the USSR?

**Rep. Walz:** There were interrogations by Soviet officials in Vietnam, but we have no evidence of such in the USSR.

**Colonel Paderin:** With due respect, this is the difference between writers and archivists. It is difficult to answer this question. We only work with the documents we have. Dealing with hearsay is very difficult.

**Rep. Walz:** We are not asserting this, but we do ask for access to the same archives.

**Colonel Paderin:** I understand.

**Rep. Walz:** There is an extensive article on use of the SAM-75 (Soviet S-75 Dvina high altitude anti-air missile – NATO designation SA-2A Guideline) missile in Vietnam. This article does not have information on U.S. personnel, but several sources in the bibliography may be of interest. We would like access to the Russian language sources in the bibliography. Yuri Nutov is the author, and it was produced as part of the Anti-Air Defense Museum. It has been 20 years since the U.S. side of the USRJC has visited this museum. We request permission to do so again.

**Colonel Paderin:** We will look into this. Should not be a problem.

**Rep. Walz:** I want to express my deep appreciation to you, Colonel Paderin. We understand the sensitive nature of what we are asking. My desire as an old soldier and congressman is to find closure for the families. Now, how can we be of help?

Colonel Paderin: I can promise to keep working, but cannot promise results. We are willing to continue cooperation. We are still willing to work with our classified documents. We are willing to provide specific information as it applies to missing individuals. We work to field 600-800 inquiries daily from private and foreign citizens – hence our work is not just for the USRJC. There is no closure for families until we can find the fates of their loved ones. This is an existing thrust of the policy of the Ministry of Defense (MOD). For example, WWII – 10 million documents – 10% [of which] are still classified. MOD maintains a website [called] "People's Memory." It lists the personnel who lost their lives – they are uploaded there – including the names of the missing. It has gravesites as well. There are 350,000 pieces of information on Russian POWS who died in German captivity. President Putin asks us to continue searching. We will keep working on eliminating information gaps. Marshall Alexander Suvorov said: "The war is not over until the last soldier is buried."

Submit the questions that interest you to your office in Moscow. From there, they can be sent to the U.S., where we have opened our Washington office with Maxim Alexeyev. With respect to our requests, they are mostly concerned with WWII and the Soviet Afghanistan war. We have some questions about Chechnya and Ossetia. We want to apprise you that our archives hold 20 million documents. We are trying to digitize and upload as much as possible. We have lots of work to do in the social and legal area. We focus on providing certificates to veterans so they can get paid. By law, we must fulfill requests from Russian veterans first. As a member of the Vietnam War working group, I will do everything I can to solve your questions.

**Rep. Walz:** You are a busy man. We are very grateful to you for your sincere willingness to work with us. Next week I will be home in my district. Next week is Memorial Day to honor our heroes. Some families of those who are MIA will be there. I will convey to these families that our Russian friends are willing to help us. It will bring comfort to the families that someone of your rank and prestige is still searching for their loved ones.

## Vietnam War Working Group session, 1000-1200, 24 May 2016

#### **Present:**

Mr. Kristoff, Colonel Taranov followed by Colonel Paderin, CDR Knollmueller, Maj Cherek, Two DOS interpreters.

**Mr. Kristoff (acting for Rep. Walz)**: I am sorry that Congressman Walz cannot join the group today. We have one document to pass – and then we will be ready to discuss our results we will present at the closing session of the plenum. This document was published in Vietnam about Soviet trawler [recovery and salvage] operations during the Vietnam War. [Mr. Kristoff

provides the two-page article in both English and Russian versions]. It is the last paragraph in the document that is of concern to us. We are not interested in intelligence or technical data – just any information about remains of our servicemen.

**Colonel Taranov (acting for Colonel Paderin):** What is the source of this information? Was this a private person? How reliable is this?

**Mr. Kristoff:** We do not know.

**Colonel Taranov:** We will check on this. Now I would like to present you with our work in the other working groups. We are ready to go back to the practice of looking for POW/MIA information in any classification in any document. In the past, the U.S. side gave us SECRET (redacted) documents. We would like to do the same. We need agreement of the Vietnam working group to do this.

Mr. Kristoff: We agree 100%.

**Colonel Taranov:** This is the only way. Thank you for your support. We will look into this article. [Mr. Taranov scans the article] I have not seen this information before, but we will look into it. If such work was conducted, we will look into the archives. Do you have a summary?

**Mr. Kristoff:** We can summarize point-by-point. [Mr. Kristoff summarizes questions posed by U.S. side during yesterday's Vietnam Working Group] The U.S. side will provide in the future specific examples. We would appreciate speaking with Russian veterans from the Vietnam War.

**Colonel Taranov:** We will provide assistance in finding them. We will go back to the practice of interviewing live veterans.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Thank you. May I give an example of how that helps us? We have many teams working in Vietnam. Usually, solving a MIA case comes from finding the right witness. U.S. veterans can only help so far. After U.S. forces left Vietnam, we need witnesses from the Vietnamese side so we can see where remains of U.S. servicemen are buried. We hope we can ask Russian veterans of the Vietnam War about shoot-downs of U.S. aircraft, since they may know of shoot-down and/or burial locations.

**Colonel Taranov:** Every year we locate 15,000 remains from WWII. We are losing witnesses, but we use the same methodology as you do to find the missing. We work with the *Wehrmacht* (German WWII) veterans as well. We are happy to help you.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Next point – can you help us find information on Soviet interrogation of U.S. POWs in Southeast Asia? We realize these records are probably not with the MOD archives.

**Colonel Taranov:** Definitely, something like that needs to be included in our protocol. We are part of an inter-agency group of archivists. We will request such documents from other archives.

**Mr. Kristoff:** We do not believe that the practice was widespread, but we have heard stories. Was there a plan to transport U.S. prisoners to the USSR? This issue is very important to our family members, and we hear about it often.

**Colonel Taranov:** This issue has been looked into for many years with no evidence. However, we will continue to search in this area.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Last issue – the SA-75 missile article. Can you help us with this bibliography? We hope most of it is unclassified.

**Colonel Taranov:** That is easy to resolve.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Is there anything you wish to add? Are there any other things to discuss?

Colonel Taranov: I think we have resolved everything. We will work as fast as possible. We have new members in our Commission. We have our issues, and the U.S. side of the Commission will also keep working. We are interested in German documents from WWII, since there are one million missing Russian POWs from that war. We are working to scan and place documents online. We have 80 million documents on line. We have a list of 9 million Soviet soldiers we lost in WWII. We want to create a joint information system. A global system will expedite the search for missing servicemen. We are ready to cooperate.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Thank you. This is my first plenum since the 18<sup>th</sup> Plenum in 2002. This is a better session since our relationship is so much better.

**Colonel Taranov:** Our work has never stopped, despite the challenges in our other relationships. Thank you very much.

#### Colonel Paderin arrives and Colonel Taranov leaves.

**Colonel Paderin:** Following yesterday's suggestions, please summarize our work, and also provide our overall conclusions.

**Mr. Kristoff:** First item: the last paragraph of an article about Soviet trawler [salvage and recovery] operations during the Vietnam War. We are not interested in intelligence, just the location and type of aircraft and any human remains.

**Colonel Paderin:** Did you [lose] a lot of aircraft over the sea? How many?

**Mr. Kristoff:** I do not have that information right now. We presume the article deals with shallow water losses if divers were present in the salvage operations.

**Colonel Paderin:** Articles and books are not a reliable source of information, but we are ready to work in this direction. To be clear in defining the problem, we need access to your losses – it is not classified what is required.

**Mr. Kristoff:** We are interested in wreckage where Soviet divers may have surveyed underwater crash sites.

**Colonel Paderin:** Do you want documents recorded from the crash sites?

**Mr. Kristoff:** The locations the documents were recorded from.

**Colonel Paderin:** We could look for land crash sites as well.

**Mr. Kristoff:** We agree. Issue Two: Information from the special group that worked in Vietnam: details from the KGB archives as they relate to U.S. prisoners from 1965-1974.

**Colonel Paderin:** You are interested in crash sites and lost personnel?

**Mr. Kristoff:** Yes. It is our understanding that those records are not in the MOD archives, but rather in other archives. You spoke to us about your inter-agency commission that works declassification issues. We appreciate that.

**Colonel Paderin:** We will work on an inter-agency decision. If one member of our commission objects, then the document cannot be declassified. If it still contains state secrets, then it cannot be declassified. However, if still classified, we can still see if excerpts can be provided.

**Mr. Kristoff:** We have similar processes. We appreciate your efforts here. We also request assistance in finding Russian veterans [of the Vietnam War] to interview.

**Colonel Paderin:** We must adhere to Russian law to protect Russian personal identifiable information. We have the right to privacy laws. Individual citizens must give permission. Not every veteran or witness wants to share – memories may be too unpleasant for some. This is the most sensitive issue. We must be in compliance with this issue.

**Mr. Kristoff:** I understand. I interview veterans who do not want to talk.

**Colonel Paderin:** It is not easy with our veterans. Officers have files, so they are easy. NCOs (non-commissioned officers) are more difficult. MOD does not track the post-discharge careers and residency of former soldiers. We need help from Ministry of Internal Affairs or Federal Migration Service offices to find the place of residence.

**Mr. Kristoff:** Next Issue: Soviet involvement in the interrogation of U.S. Vietnam POWs. We have heard stories over the years. We know MOD archives do not have this information, but other archives might have information on this.

**Colonel Paderin:** We will ask. I have seen such information from the Korean War. We will ask the FSB [Federal Security Service] to see if they can provide such information.

**Mr. Kristoff:** I am sure the Korean Group will be interested as well.

**Colonel Paderin:** Do you have information on service members whom you know were captured, but did not come back?

**Mr. Kristoff:** We can provide lists of personnel who died in captivity.

**Colonel Paderin:** In the Korea War Working Group, relatives of the missing believe some walked out of Korea and China, and somehow wound up in the Soviet Union. We have seen movies. Families do not want to lose hope.

**Commander Knollmueller:** We have found that these types of survivor myths are not all that uncommon. It is a coping mechanism for some families.

**Colonel Paderin:** We have the same thing. Some are still waiting for lost relatives from WWII to come home.

**Mr. Kristoff:** The next issue is the mention of a plan to bring knowledgeable Americans to the USSR.

**Colonel Paderin:** We talked about this yesterday. Whenever military action was overseas, there were enough Soviet experts on site so as not to risk the transportation of POWs to Moscow. It is easier to transfer information than it is to transfer people. Are you interested in finding such documents?

**Mr. Kristoff:** We are interested in interrogation or transfers. We are interested in finding the remains of fallen U.S. service members. I do find it encouraging that a structure was in place, so are there records of this exchange structure and records of interrogations?

**Colonel Paderin:** If we go back in history, then there were very rare occasions where such a transfer might have been risked. Usually, such a transfer would only be contemplated if such an event could change the course of a war. To transport a regular American POW into the territory of the Soviet Union would not be worth it.

**Mr. Kristoff:** We also requested help in finding bibliographic items from the SA-75 missile article. That article is from the Anti-Air Defense (PVO) Museum, a component of the Central Museum of the Armed Forces. The article itself does not discuss missing U.S. service members, but items in the bibliography might.

**Colonel Paderin:** There are certain things we are interested in for WWII, Afghanistan, and Chechnya. As far as Vietnam is concerned, we do not have any questions.

## Cold War Working Group session, 1300-1500, 23 May 2016

#### **Present:**

Mr. Shea, General-Lieutenant Khristoforov, Dr. Connell, Ms. Koryakina, MSgt Erwin, Two DOS interpreters

**Mr. Shea**: Good afternoon. Vasiliy Sergeyevich [Khristoforov (khrist-o-FOR-ov)], my name is Tim Shea, and would like to welcome you to the Pentagon and to the first Cold War Working Group session since 2005. I am the Defense Intelligence Officer for Eurasia and I served as Army Attache at our Embassy in Moscow when I was on active duty. I would like to introduce Dr. James G. Connell Jr., who has worked with the USRJC since he established the first office representing the U.S. Side of the USRJC at U.S. Embassy Moscow in May 1992. Dr. Connell has worked with the USRJC nine years in Moscow and another fifteen years here in Washington.

Dr. Connell is the Acting Executive Secretary of the U.S. Side of the Commission and is the DPAA Senior Cold War research analyst dealing with what we call the Cold War incidents, 39 U.S. reconnaissance aircraft which were shot down by the Soviets near or over the Soviet Union between 1950 and 1965, with at least two exceptions for incidents where the cause of loss was most likely weather-related or unknown.

In all but ten of these incidents, the Soviets returned either air crewmen who survived and/or remains resulting in there being no missing airmen from these 29 flights. The ten remaining incidents in which there were still airmen missing in action became the object of study of the Cold War Working Group when the USRJC was created in 1992. At the very beginning of its work in 1992, the U.S. Side acknowledged that the airplanes were not on routine training or weather-related missions, but were attempting to collect electronic intelligence; at the same time, the Russian side acknowledged that, in all but two instances, Soviet fighters had shot down the planes.

The Russian Side even provided the names and last known coordinates of the fighter pilots who engaged the aircraft, and most of the pilots still living in the nineties were interviewed by Commission researchers in places like Sevastopol, Yevpatoria, Riga, and Moscow. In general, the pilots knew very little about the shoot downs or the fates of the crew. They fired their machine guns, returned to base and were told nothing about subsequent events. In some cases where the shoot down was public knowledge, the pilots received medals.

For example, Senior Lieutenants Ivan Yalovlyevich Lukashev of Nikopol, Ukraine, and Moisey Kuzmich Shchukin of Primorsky Kray were awarded the Order of the Red Banner for shooting down the U.S. Navy P2V on November 6, 1951, as announced on the front page of the newspaper, Red Star, on November 23, 1951. Documents indicate that, when they were summoned to headquarters both Lukashev and Shchukin thought they were in big trouble for shooting down the plane and were surprised that they were being given medals.

The USSR's reaction when its air defense forces succeeded in destroying a reconnaissance flight was varied. Sometimes, there was outright denial that her fighters had played any role in shooting down the plane. This was the case in the September 2, 1958 shoot down of a C-130 cargo plane, flying out of Incirlik Air Base, Turkey, 55 miles northwest of Yerevan, Armenia, the only incident in which the U.S. acknowledged violating Soviet air space at the time of the incident. The aircraft, with a crew of 17 aboard, crashed and burned near the village of Sasnashen, Soviet Armenia. Within two weeks, six sets of remains were handed over to U.S. representatives by the Soviets. In August 1993, the U.S. Side of the Joint Commission conducted an on-site investigation of the crash site in Armenia, with excavation of the site carried out by a team from the Army's Central Identification Laboratory, Hawaii (CILHI), which is now a component of DPAA.

The team recovered bone and tooth fragments, life-support equipment, personal effects and aircraft wreckage. As a result of the expert analysis after this meticulous excavation, identification was made for the group remains of the entire crew. On September 2, 1998, exactly forty years after the incident, the remains were buried with honors in a service at Arlington National Cemetery.

Documents provided by the Central Archives of the Russian Ministry of Defense at Podolsk greatly facilitated the Commission's investigation of this incident. These documents consisted of Anti-Air Defense (PVO) records with reports from the Soviet pilots involved in the intercept and shoot down, as well as actual gun camera photography.

With the cooperation of the Russian Side, U.S. researchers set out to identify both U.S. and Russian archival documents, including various reports and gun camera photography, to shed light on the other nine incidents. Hundreds of interviews and field investigations have been carried out throughout the former Soviet Union. This information was then shared with the families of those still missing.

Archives at Podolsk, the Central Archives of the Russian Navy at Gatchina, and the Central Archives of the Border Guards at Pushkino. Documents have also been received from the Federal Security Service Archives, which you so proudly serve as chief, and the Presidential Archives, which is now subordinate to General Volkogonov's long-time assistant and the first Executive Secretary of the Russian Side of the USRJC, Sergey Nikolayevich Osipov. Sergey Nikolayevich is now President Putin's assistant for Presidential Documentation.

Before we turn to the U.S. Side's specific requests, I would now like to ask Dr. Connell to give a brief overview of each of the Cold War incidents in which we are still seeking information on missing airmen.

#### Dr. Connell:

- 1. 8 April 1950. USN PB4Y2 shot down over the Baltic Sea, west of Liepaja (Libau), Latvia. Entire crew of ten is missing. This probably our most researched incident. I believe we have interviewed at least a hundred witnesses in Kaliningrad and Latvia in connection with this. We have investigated reports of burial sites in Baltiysk and Liepaja. Every year since 1999, the Latvian Navy and American Embassy Riga have held a ceremony in Liepaja honoring the crew. On occasion, relatives of crew members have been able to attend these ceremonies, as well as sailors from VP-26, the parent squadron of the PB4Y2.
- 2. 6 November 1951. USN P2V shot down southeast of Vladivostok. Entire crew of ten is missing. This is another incident which has been well researched. We have carried out an excavation at Novosysoyevka near Vladivostok and interviewed a number of witnesses in the Russian Far East.
- 3. 13 June 1952. USAF RB-29 shot down over the Sea of Japan. American search planes found empty life rafts, but no survivors. Entire crew of twelve is missing. We have researched memoirs by a Soviet geologist which may relate to this incident as well as investigated connections with interviews of the crew of a U.S. plane shot down in China about a month later.
- 4. 7 October 1952. USAF RB-29 shot down north of Hokkaido. The remains of Capt John Dunham were recovered on Yury Island in the Kuriles in 1994. This was the result of a report from a former Border Guards sailor in Rostov on the Don and a joint Russian-American excavation based on documents provided by the Border Guards archives. Eight men remain missing.
- 5. 29 July 1953. USAF RB-50 shot down over the Sea of Japan. Capt John Roche was rescued at the time. The remains of Capt Stanley O'Keefe and Master Sergeant Francis Brown were recovered along the coast of Japan. Fourteen men are still missing. We were able to find a maritime chart with the track of the flight on it in the Central Navy Archives in Gatchina near St Petersburg.
- 6. 17 April 1955. USAF RB-47 shot down east of Kamchatka. The Soviets tracked the U.S. search effort and sent their own patrols into the wreckage area. The entire crew of three is missing.
- 7. 10 September 1956. USAF RB-50 apparently lost to Typhoon Emma over the Sea of Japan. No evidence of shoot down. Entire crew of 16 is missing.
- 8. 1 July 1960. USAF RB-47 shot down over Barents Sea. Captains John McKone and Bruce Olmstead were rescued by a Soviet trawler and held captive at Lubyanka prison until 25 January 1961 when, as a gesture to the newly-inaugurated President John F. Kennedy, they were released and sent home to their loving wives. Plane commander Capt Willard Palm's remains were found

on the shore in Japan and returned 25 Jul 1960. Soviet documents from that time indicate Capt Eugene Posa's remains were recovered in October 1960, but their disposition is unknown. Posa and the other two crewmembers remain unaccounted for.

9. 14 December 1965. USAF RB-57 lost on patrol over the Black Sea. There is no evidence indicating it was lost to hostile action. Search and rescue efforts by US, Turkish, and Soviet forces discovered parts of the aircraft, but no survivors or remains. Both crewmembers remain unaccounted for.

**Mr.Shea:** Thank you very much, Dr. Connell. At this point, I would like to thank you, Vasiliy Stepanovich, and the other officials who have served on the Russian Side of the USRJC over the past 24 years for all the information we have been able to gather in an attempt to clarify the fates of the young men who were serving their country so faithfully. Before we take a short break, perhaps you would like to comment on the foregoing summation of the work of the Cold War Working Group.

General-Lieutenant Khristoforov: I am somewhat familiar with each of these cases. During the lull between plenums research in our archives continued. I am aware of only one case where a U.S. reconnaissance aircraft was ordered to overfly the border of the former Soviet Union and that was the 1 May 1960 Gary Powers case. All other reconnaissance aircraft were ordered to shadow the border, but not cross it. I am aware that CIA personnel were present at mission briefings prior to recon flights. I know of only three American personnel who were imprisoned at Moscow's Lubyanka prison, the most famous of these being Gary Powers [the other two were Bruce Olmstead and John McKone from the 1 July 1960 shoot down of a USAF RB-47]. This plane was probably shot down in retaliation for Gary Powers. I think the RB-47 probably deviated from the mission course due to weather and was subsequently shot down for political reasons.

**Dr. Connell:** I have interviewed many of the Soviet pilots who shot down our aircraft during the Cold War. It is interesting that they had very little knowledge or information on the fates of the aircraft they had just shot down with their guns.

General-Lieutenant Khristoforov: It was due to the speeds of the aircraft, and the fact that no parachutes were observed after the shoot downs. You are aware that all the prisoners that were held at Lubyanka were eventually returned to American control in a show of good will between the two nations. Reports of other survivors of these shoot downs *do not exist*. We investigated the possibility that there were American survivors and that they were sent to the Gulag upon being captured, but found no reports. We will once again investigate the possibility that survivors were sent to the GULAG, but it is a "long shot" that such reports exist.

**Dr. Connell:** Is it possible that Americans were captured and sent to the GULAG without the knowledge of the KGB?

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** Absolutely not! There would absolutely have to be records if that had occurred. Turning to a different topic, we seek your assistance in accounting for Soviet soldiers still missing from the Soviet War in Afghanistan, 1979-1989. There are about 264 missing Soviet soldiers from this conflict.

**Dr. Connell:** As you know, we have been working on this issue since 1992. Ambassador Peter Thomsen carried out a special Afghan mission in June of 1992.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** We are still very interested in information on the uprising at the Badaber Prison in Pakistan in 1985 where all the Soviet soldiers there were killed. In 1992, Afghanistan acknowledged the uprising and said that all documents have been destroyed concerning this. Is it possible to look into this using your channels in Afghanistan?

**Dr. Connell:** In 2006, we provided information to General Ruslan Aushev through the Russian Side of the Commission with eight enclosures including information from the Pakistani government. The information was inconclusive as to Soviet soldiers who might have survived the uprising and explosions. Certainly, we can look into this subject again, particularly, since the list of Afghan War MIAs has been pared from over 300 to the present 264 since 1997.

#### BREAK.

Mr. Shea: Now we would like to turn to a number of issues for which we seek the assistance of the Russian Side. After visits to Severomorsk, Sevastopol, and Vladivostok in the 1990's by the late RADM (ret.) Boris Gavrilovich Novyy and Dr. Jim Connell, the U.S. side in 2005 requested access to the archives of the Northern, Pacific, and Black Sea fleets via direct correspondence through the Russian side to the Chiefs-of-Staff of the above mentioned organizations. Only the Pacific Fleet in Vladivostok responded, and RADM Novyy worked in the Pacific Fleet Archives in 2005. These archives are the most likely places where information might be found about losses of U.S. aircraft from the Cold War era that occurred at sea. The U.S. side seeks the assistance of the Russian side in gaining permission for Commission researchers to examine the holdings of the Northern and Black Sea Fleet archives for information about missing American servicemen from the Cold War era.

General-Lieutenant Khristoforov: Actually, these archives are subordinate to Colonel Paderin, who is present, so you should take this up with him. Requests for archival access should be made through the DPAA Moscow Office, but a request for general access is far too broad. Requests should focus on specific incidents and time periods. Information of the fates of the air crews would not be found in fleet archives. You should make specific requests and then make additional requests based on the results of the research. I would appreciate it if you would copy me on all requests you make so I can follow up on them.

**Mr. Shea:** Thank you. At the Commission's 18<sup>th</sup> Plenum in November 2002 (and in several correspondences since then), former U.S. Chairman Major General Roland Lajoie requested

confirmation of reports that fragments from downed Cold War-era U.S. aircraft—specifically the U.S. Navy PB4Y-2 "Privateer," shot down on April 8, 1950—were sent to Aircraft Factory #315. Russian Chairman General-Major Vladimir Zolotarev responded that the FSB was still looking into the matter, but the U.S. side has not received a final response from the Russian side on this matter. In our previous request, the U.S. side asked for:

- 1) The location of the factory (which might still hold the aircraft wreckage);
- 2) The names of former workers from the factory who may have participated in the analysis of the wreckage;
- 3) Actual reports of the analysis, and;
- 4) The condition of the wreckage, which might provide further details as to the likelihood of survivors of the shoot down.

We have established through open-source research that Aircraft Factory #315 does still exist and has been an active factory since 1942. Basic facts known to us already are:

- 1) Factory #315 was formed on the site of evacuated Factory #33 in April 1942;
- 2) Beginning in 1942, Factory #315 produced aircraft engines;
- 3) In March 1944, Factory #315 absorbed Factory #487;
- 4) In August 1945, Factory #315 transferred its Carburetor shop to Factory #33;
- 5) In 1946, Factory #315 acquired resources from Bosch (Wansee);
- 6) In the 1940s, the factory's director was F.A. Korotkov;
- 7) In the 1950s, Factory #315 produced rocket engines;
- 8) From 1963 to 1992, the Director of Factory #315 was I.I. Rumyansev, who was followed in this position by V.I. Dedilov, and;
- 9) Factory #315 is located on Ulitsa Pravdy 23.

The U.S. side seeks access to Aircraft Factory #315, its archive, and the opportunity to interview employees there who may have had contact with the wreckage, and, if it still exists, to determine whether or not the condition of the wreckage might provide clues as to the likelihood of survivors and the fate of the crew. If the factory still holds wreckage from any other American Cold War-era shoot down, the U.S. side requests the opportunity to examine it.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** I hate to disappoint you, but the workers of Aircraft Factory #315, if they existed, are probably dead by now. But I will verify any rumors connected with the factory. It is quite possible that such a factory existed.

**Dr. Connell:** Please check in your archives, which hold the old MGB (Ministry of State Security) documents, for information on the factory and any parts of the plane.

## Cold War Working Group session, 1000-1200, 24 May 2016

#### **Present:**

Mr. Shea, General-Lieutenant Khristoforov, Dr. Connell, Ms. Koryakina, MSgt Erwin, Two DOS Interpreters

Mr. Shea: Several years ago, former Russian Side Executive Secretary Colonel Sergey Nikolayevich Osipov told U.S. family member Pat Lively Dickinson (the sister of a missing American from the Cold War) that photographs were taken of the downing of a U.S. aircraft in the region of Vladivostok on November 6, 1951. Based on this assertion, along with the fact that the Russian side provided the U.S. side with gun camera photography of the downing of another U.S. aircraft on September 2, 1958, the former U.S. Cold War Working Group Co-Chairman, Mr. A. Denis Clift, was convinced that gun camera photography exists for all of the shoot downs that occurred in the Vladivostok region. Unfortunately, the Russian side said that Russian archives hold no further gun camera photography. The U.S. side requests that the Russian side accomplish a more detailed search for gun camera photography of the November 6, 1951, shoot down and provide that photography to the U.S. side.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** First of all, I have spoken with Colonel Paderin about our archival discussions yesterday, he reiterated the necessity of a narrow, focused window for search requests. Such a request for gun camera photography must also be focused.

**Dr. Connell:** Is it possible that gun camera photography could be found at the Central Naval Archives in Gatchina?

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** Yes, and we can also check in the Pacific Fleet archives in Vladivostok.

**Mr. Shea:** During a research mission to the Russian Far East in the nineties by Dr. Jim Connell and in March 2005 by the late Rear Admiral Boris Novyy, we learned that important documents of the Russian Border Guards Service were often sent to the FSB Archives in Omsk. This was confirmed by RADM Novyy in the Pacific Fleet Archives and by Dr. Connell in the UVD (Directorate of Internal Affairs) Archives in both Vladivostok and Khabarovsk. The U.S. Side requests that the holdings of the FSB archive in Omsk be reviewed for possible information on U.S. MIAs.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** This information is not correct. Records of the Border Guards, both as an independent agency and as a component of the Federal Security Service, have never been transferred to Omsk.

**Mr. Shea:** Until 2003, Rear Admiral Boris Novyy worked in the Russian Border Guards Service Archives in Pushkino reviewing documents connected with the Cold War shoot downs of U.S. aircraft. The U.S. side seeks permission for USRJC representatives to continue work in the Border Guards Archives in Pushkino.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** I say once again that you must focus your search efforts in the Border Guard archives, or any other archive. What are you are looking for in these particular archives?

**Dr. Connell:** We are looking for information that might clarify the fates of our missing servicemen. Obviously, we need to provide the numbers of possible Soviet units involved, dates and circumstances of loss, etc.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** Of course, archival access is a philosophical concept and if you want successful access, it is best to specify time frame, unit designations, and any other pertinent data.

Mr. Shea: I would like to turn to a U.S. Navy A-6E loss on 22 May 1983. LTJG Patrick K. Inglis, USN, and his Bombardier Navigator, LCDR J.D. Austin, USN, were assigned to the U.S. Navy's A-6E Attack Squadron opelating on the USS Eisenhower. On May 22, 1983, the aircraft they were flying crashed in the vicinity of a Soviet Task Force. The crash occurred in the Mediterranean alongside two Soviet Naval vessels, the *Novorossysk* and the *Kashin*, some 50 miles or more from the USS Eisenhower (the latitude and longitude of the crash site were approximately: 34 degrees, 55 minutes North and 18 degrees, 44 minutes East). While a second A6E was able to take pictures of the crash site immediately after the incident (clearly showing the Soviet Naval vessels) that aircraft did not witness the crash itself so no U.S. witnesses were able to shed any light on the matter. U.S. Navy search and rescue personnel reached the site a few hours after the crash but were unable to locate or recover the remains of the two aviators. The U.S. Side seeks access to relevant archival material located at the Central Archives of the Russian Navy in Gatchina. Soviet Naval personnel almost certainly witnessed the aircraft crash and would most likely have recorded the event in their ships' logs. Any information found would help formulate a final and accurate explanation to the families as to the circumstances of loss of these two men.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** This is similar to the other requests. Submit the details, and I am sure we will look into this case.

**Mr. Shea:** On March 22, 1951, a USAF C-124 tail number 49-0244, after a refueling stop at Loring AFB in Maine, headed for Mildenhall RAFB in England. Early on March 23, about 700

miles southwest of Ireland at approximately 50 degrees, 45', 0" North; 24 degrees, 3', 0" West, the C-124 issued a Mayday call, reporting a fire in the cargo hold. The C-124 ditched in one piece, and its location was reported by a U.S. B-29. One of the largest search and rescue operations in history began only nineteen hours later, and nothing, including human remains of the 53 persons aboard, was found aside from some charred plywood and a single briefcase. Dozens of airplanes, weather ships, a British submarine, and several U.S. Navy warships, including the aircraft carrier, USS CORAL SEA, scoured thousands of square miles of the ocean. There were reports that Soviet submarines and surface ships were active in the area of the crash. The U.S. Side seeks access to relevant archival material located at the Russian Navy Archives in Gatchina which might shed light on the fate of this C-124 and its 53 passengers. Soviet Naval personnel almost certainly witnessed the aircraft crash and would most likely have recorded the event in their ships' logs. Any information found would help formulate a final and accurate explanation to the families as to the circumstances of loss of these 53 men.

General-Lieutenant Khristoforov: Send your request and we will look into it.

**Mr. Shea:** Thank you very much. Now we would like to entertain any issues the Russian Side would like to present.

**General-Lieutenant Khristoforov:** I believe we have covered our issues in the course of our discussions.

# Closing Session of the 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum, 1200, 24 May 2016

**General Foglesong:** I propose we present brief summaries from each working group. I want to discuss a few action items we would like to advance, and then make some closing remarks.

**General Vostrotin:** I totally agree. I think the best part of the work has been in the working groups. It has been a good experience that provides the opportunity for our future work.

## **World War II Working Group Results:**

**Colonel Nikiforov:** Both sides agree that work on our WWII dead and missing is noble. We received a large amount of information from one another. We also feel that there has never been a gap in our work. [Summarizes the case of the WWII PBN-1 "Nomad" crash in Norway in 1944 with the possibility that the Soviet aviators are buried in Neuville, Belgium]. We discussed common methodologies and approaches. I am not sure we have ever had such a large exchange of information.

**General Foglesong.** This plenum inspired the work of the PBN-1 researcher.

**Dr. Nenninger:** I would like to thank my colleague, Colonel Nikiforov. We got a good briefing from the Russian side – particularly on the state of the Russian WWII archives. We raised the issue of a B-26 Marauder that crashed on an island in the Bering Sea in WWII. We will provide

more detailed information about this loss to the Russian side. These discussions emphasize the importance and challenges of archives in this mission. I look forward to the Russian visit to the National Archives at College Park, MD tomorrow.

## **Korean War Working Group Results:**

**Admiral Komoedov:** Thank you, Mr. Linnington, that the plenum took place in an atmosphere of openness and understanding. All requests for information were taken and will be considered, though the unpredictability of the North Korean government remains a challenge. We provided an article to the U.S. side. We must move forward and take all necessary steps. I would like to mention an article I wrote about Russian help to the United States during the U.S. civil war.

Mr. Linnington: I enjoyed the discussion over the last two days with our Russian counterparts. I chaired the working group on behalf of Congressman Sam Johnson. I also enjoyed having Mr. Dan Baughman, who has studied the Korean War for two decades, with us. Our discussions were frank, open, and transparent. We had a long list of areas we will cooperate on next year. We asked for help in topographical maps for shoot down data [of U.S. aircraft] in North Korea. Since we have no access to the DPRK, we have a challenge to help our families with the missing from that war. We recognize how hard it is to access data from the DPRK. Major Harvey sat in on our group as well. We also discussed declassification of information. I appreciate the article [written by Admiral Komoedov], which I will share with the U.S. commissioners on the U.S. side.

**General Foglesong:** I was happy to hear both sides trying to help one another in the Korean War working group.

## **Vietnam War Working Group Results:**

Colonel Paderin: It was a positive meeting that sets the tone for future work. Our work in the Vietnam War Working Group is not as advanced as in other groups, but questions raised by the U.S. side can be further discussed. There are some peculiarities in Russian law that challenge our ability to get the requested information, but I think we can still move forward. Questions raised concerned mostly interrogation of American POWs. This type of information may be in the MOD archives, or in other archives. We have representatives from different archives on the Commission, so we can try to work together to find the pertinent documents. As Chief of Archives for the Ministry of Defense, these documents are my responsibility, and granting access to foreigners is also my responsibility. Considering the exchange of information in the past, we request more specific, concrete information for document requests. Requests that can cover multiple decades can be hard without specifics.

**Mr. Kristoff:** I would like to pass on thanks from Congressman Walz for a good session. We were given a good primer on the challenges there are in Russia for obtaining information. For

example, there are laws that protect the privacy of veterans. However, we look forward to working together to overcome these challenges.

## **Cold War Working Group Results:**

General-Lieutenant Khristoforov: Any war is a tragedy for the countries and the people in those wars. However, wars have rules – it should be clean. However, such rules were not followed in the Cold War. For me, it is unclear why the U.S. side would fly reconnaissance aircraft so close to the USSR. We would shoot them down, and repeatedly ask that the U.S. not do that. If politicians behaved, we would have less work to do. But, what happened – happened. We need to find the fate of every U.S. and Soviet soldier from that time. We have discussed every possibility for archival cooperation. We will provide maximum assistance from our side. The U.S. side will look to see if we can find information on missing Russians in Afghanistan. I thank my American colleagues.

**Mr. Tim Shea:** Thank you General Khristoforov. I agree it was a difficult war, and there are many different interpretations of the Cold War, but I will stick to our work here. Meeting every 11 years is not good, as time is not on our side. We talked about aircraft factory #315 in 1950. Witnesses in 1950 may be 86 years old today. We did not have any breakthroughs, but we agreed to meet more often. The U.S. side discussed nine incidents in detail, and requested archival access for six more. We received a request to help find the 264 Soviet soldiers still missing in Afghanistan. We might be able to provide some help in this area.

#### **Concluding Remarks:**

**General Vostrotin:** I do not think I need to add any comments. We are very happy with the results.

**General Foglesong:** There will be multiple action items from each group. For the next plenum, we can report back on the status of the action items. We have a sense of momentum. I would like thoughts on when and where we can have the next plenum. Second issue, we need to start on a design for the commemorative coin for the 25<sup>th</sup> year of this commission. It sounds tactical, but it is a strategic consideration for our group.

General Vostrotin: This is a good chance to learn from each other and work together. I see the main idea of mission of the Commission is to use what has been said here, forget the years of the passive stage in the activity of Plenary Sessions of the Commission, and start from here. We are happy for new strength and new forces in our group to help with our work. We are happy to hear about the work in Europe and Russia. The Russian Red Cross provided good information. I would like to express my personal gratitude to General Foglesong and Mr. Linnington. Their visits to Moscow helped start this momentum. The result of this Plenum is a practical step forward. We should meet in an island in the Pacific (jokingly – laughter). Seriously, the Russian Side suggests that we next meet in Russia... in Sochi or perhaps St. Petersburg, perhaps in the

early fall of 2017 after elections. [The parliamentary elections for the Seventh convocation of the State Duma are scheduled for 18 September 2016.] I have an interesting question to raise: should politicians be added to our work? Maybe a goal of our Commission is to help our politicians talk to one another – or, maybe, this is not appropriate?

**General Foglesong:** I think we should stay as we are for now. Politicians can help us with "throw-weight" for our issues, but there is a concern about mixing politics with past conflict personnel accountability.

**General Vostrotin:** The last thing I would like to do is to express my deep gratitude to the executive secretaries on both sides, Colonel Taranov and Dr. Connell. And thanks to Major Harvey of the U.S. Side and Lieutenant Colonel Alexeyev of the Russian Side.

**General Foglesong:** And my last comment will be to thank all people sitting around the wall who also worked so hard and contributed so much to make a successful 20<sup>th</sup> Plenum of the USRJC.

1330 Gift Exchange and Adjournment